

1 **Title: Perinatal outcomes in singleton live births after fresh blastocyst-stage embryo**
2 **transfer: a retrospective analysis of 67,147 IVF/ICSI cycles**

3 **Running title:** Perinatal outcomes of blastocyst-stage embryo transfer

4 **Authors:** Nicola Marconi^{1,*}, Edwin Amalraj Raja², Siladitya Bhattacharya² Abha Maheshwari¹

5 ¹Aberdeen Maternity Hospital NHS Grampian, Aberdeen AB25 2ZL, Scotland, UK ²School of
6 Medicine and Dentistry, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen AB25 2ZD, Scotland, UK

7 *Correspondence address. Aberdeen Maternity Hospital NHS Grampian, Aberdeen AB25
8 2ZL, Scotland, UK. E-mail: nicola.m4289@gmail.com. [https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1858-](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1858-3801)

9 [3801](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1858-3801)

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 **Abstract**

22 **Study question:** Are perinatal outcomes different between singleton live births conceived from
23 fresh blastocyst transfer than those following the transfer of fresh cleavage-stage embryos?

24 **Summary answer:** Fresh blastocyst transfer does not increase risks of preterm birth, low/high
25 birth weight and congenital anomaly, alter the sex ratio at birth or prejudice the chance of a
26 having a healthy baby.

27 **What is known already:** Extended embryo culture is currently considered the best option for
28 embryo selection, but concerns have been raised about increased risks of preterm delivery and
29 large for gestational age (LGA) babies.

30 **Study design, size, duration:** We conducted a retrospective cohort study based on data from
31 the Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority (HFEA) anonymised and cycle-based
32 dataset in the United Kingdom (UK) between 1999 and 2011.

33 **Participants/materials, setting, methods:** Baseline characteristics were compared between
34 blastocyst-stage and cleavage-stage embryo transfer cycles using the Chi-squared test for
35 categorical/dichotomised covariates and the Mann-Whitney test for continuous covariates.
36 Statistical significance was set at < 0.005 . Poisson regression and multinomial logistic
37 regression were used to establish relationships between perinatal outcomes and blastocyst-
38 stage embryo transfer or cleavage-stage embryo transfer. Risk ratios (RRs), adjusted risk ratios
39 (aRRs) and their 99.5% confidence intervals (CIs) were calculated as a measure of strength of
40 associations. Results were adjusted for clinically relevant covariates. A sub-group analysis
41 included women undergoing their first IVF/ICSI treatment. Level of significance was set at $<$
42 0.05 and 95% CIs were calculated in the sub-group analysis.

43 **Main results and the role of chance:** Of a total of 67,147 IVF/ICSI cycles, 11,152 involved
44 blastocyst-stage embryo(s) and 55,995 involved cleavage-stage embryo(s). The two groups

45 were comparable with regards to the risk of preterm birth (aRR 1.00, 99.5% confidence interval
46 [CI] 0.79-1.25), very preterm birth (aRR 1.00, 99.5% CI 0.63-1.54), very low birth weight
47 (aRR 0.84, 99.5% CI 0.53-1.34), low birth weight (aRR 0.92, 99.5% CI 0.73-1.16), high birth
48 weight (aRR 0.94, 99.5% CI 0.75-1.18) and very high birth weight (aRR 1.05, 99.5% CI 0.66-
49 1.65). The risk of congenital anomaly was 16% higher in the blastocyst-stage group than in the
50 cleavage-stage group but this was not statistically significant (aRR 1.16, 99.5% CI 0.90-1.49).
51 The chance of having a healthy baby (born at term, with normal birth weight and no congenital
52 anomalies) was not altered by extended culture (aRR 1.00, 99.5% CI 0.93-1.07). Extended
53 culture was associated with a marginal increase in the chance having a male baby in the main
54 cycle-based analysis (aRR 1.04, 99.5% CI 1.01-1.09), but not in the sub-group analysis of
55 women undergoing their first cycle of treatment (aRR 1.04, 95% CI 1.00-1.08). In the sub-
56 group analysis, the risk of congenital anomalies was significantly higher after blastocyst-stage
57 embryo-transfer (aRR 1.42, 95% CI 1.12-1.81).

58 **Limitations, reasons for caution:** This study is limited by the use of observational data and
59 inability to adjust for key confounders, such as maternal smoking status and body mass index
60 (BMI) which were not recorded in the HFEA dataset. As the main analysis was cycle based
61 and unable to link cycles within women undergoing more than one IVF/ICSI cycle, we
62 undertook a subgroup analysis on women undergoing their first treatment cycle.

63 **Wider implications of the findings:** Our findings should reassure women undergoing
64 blastocyst-stage embryo transfer. For the first time, we have shown that babies born after
65 blastocyst transfer have a similar chance of being healthy as those born after cleavage-stage
66 embryos transfer.

67 **Study funding/competing interest(s):** Research activity of Dr. Nicola Marconi was funded
68 by Fondo “A. Griffini-J. Miglierina”, Provincia di Varese, Italy. All the authors do not have
69 any competing interests to disclose.

70 **Key words**

71 Blastocyst, cleavage, extended culture, perinatal outcome, singleton live birth.

72 **Introduction**

73 Extended culture leading to embryo transfer at the blastocyst-stage is considered a major
74 advance in in vitro fertilisation (IVF) as it has been shown to result in higher live birth rates in
75 comparison to cleavage-stage embryo transfer (Glujovsky *et al.*, 2016). Theoretical advantages
76 of transferring blastocysts include the ability to select better quality embryos, better embryo-
77 endometrium synchronisation and reduced uterine contractility 5 days after fertilisation
78 (Maheshwari *et al.*, 2013). Extended culture is therefore perceived as the best option for
79 selecting embryos for elective single embryo transfer (eSET) by reducing the risk of multiple
80 pregnancies (Vega *et al.*, 2018), without compromising live birth rates.

81 Although there are a number of advantages, there are conflicting data on perinatal outcomes of
82 singleton pregnancies resulting from blastocyst-stage embryo transfer. Some studies are
83 suggesting a higher risk of preterm birth (PTB), very preterm birth (VPTB) and large for
84 gestational age (LGA) babies, after blastocyst-stage embryo transfer as compared to cleavage-
85 stage embryo transfer (Maheshwari *et al.*, 2013; Wang *et al.*, 2017; Alviggi *et al.*, 2018),
86 whereas others have shown no difference (Litzky *et al.*, 2018; Shi *et al.*, 2019).

87 The Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority (HFEA) database of the United Kingdom
88 (UK) is the oldest and one of the largest registers of ART treatments worldwide. The
89 anonymised version of the database provides information on every IVF/ICSI cycle performed
90 in the UK since 1991. The aim of this study was to use anonymised HFEA data to explore

91 perinatal outcomes of singleton live births following fresh blastocyst-stage embryo transfer
92 cycles in comparison to those following fresh cleavage-stage embryo transfer cycles. The use
93 of the HFEA dataset represents a unique opportunity as it contains information about more than
94 a million ART cycles performed in all the UK licensed fertility centres.

95 **Materials and methods**

96 We performed a retrospective cohort study using anonymised cycle-based HFEA data recorded
97 from 1991 to 2012 (<https://www.hfea.gov.uk/about-us/our-data/>). As these data are freely
98 available on the HFEA website, no ethical approval was necessary for their use. We selected
99 all fresh IVF/ICSI cycles that resulted in a singleton live birth after the transfer of either
100 blastocyst-stage or cleavage-stage embryo(s). Cycles transferring frozen embryos were
101 excluded as it has been shown that freezing-thawing techniques can affect perinatal outcomes
102 of IVF/ICSI singleton pregnancies (Maheshwari *et al.*, 2018). Cycles resulting in a multiple
103 pregnancy were also excluded. We wanted to focus on singleton live births as extended embryo
104 culture is considered the best option for embryo selection to achieve a singleton pregnancy. In
105 addition, perinatal outcomes of babies born from twin or higher order gestations are not
106 independent. Standard analytic approaches have not been established for the purpose of
107 exploring such outcomes, with risks of low accuracy and precision in the results (Hibbs *et al.*,
108 2010). Cycles performed before 1999 were excluded due to the extremely low number of
109 blastocyst-stage transfers; cycles performed in 2012 were excluded due to the lack of updated
110 reproductive and perinatal information in the dataset. As a consequence, the study focused on
111 the period 1999-2011. Donor/surrogate, unstimulated and preimplantation genetic testing
112 (PGT) cycles were excluded. Cycles with contradictory data, relevant to the purpose of cycle
113 selection, and missing information in outcome measures were also excluded. Cycles included
114 in the analysis were divided into 2 exposure groups: blastocyst-stage embryo transfer group
115 and cleavage-stage embryo transfer group.

116 Baseline characteristics recorded for each cycle in the anonymised HFEA dataset, such as
117 maternal age at treatment and duration of infertility, were compared between the blastocyst-
118 stage and the cleavage-stage groups. Perinatal outcomes that were assessed between the groups
119 were: gestational age at delivery (full-term birth ≥ 37 weeks, PTB 32-36 weeks + 6 days and
120 very preterm birth [VPTB] < 32 weeks), birth weight at delivery (very low birth weight
121 [VLBW] $< 1,500$ g, LBW 1,500 g-2,499 g, normal birth weight [NBW] 2,500 g-3,999 g, high
122 birth weight [HBW] 4,000 g-4,499 g and very high birth weight [VHBW] $\geq 4,500$ g), gender of
123 the baby (male;female), congenital anomaly (yes;no) and healthy baby (yes;no). In addition,
124 the categories of LBW and VLBW were combined into the category of total low birth weight
125 (TLBW). Similarly, HBW and VHBW were combined into total high birth weight (THBW).
126 In the HFEA dataset, congenital anomalies diagnosed at birth were recorded as 1 (yes) and 0
127 (no) without providing any distinctions among specific anomalies. Healthy babies were defined
128 as singletons born full-term, with a NBW and no congenital anomalies.

129 **Statistical analysis**

130 Comparison of baseline characteristics between the blastocyst-stage and the cleavage-stage
131 groups was performed using the Chi-squared test for categorical/dichotomised covariates and
132 the Mann-Whitney test for continuous covariates. Poisson regression and multinomial logistic
133 regression were used to establish relationships between binary-multiple categorical outcomes
134 and blastocyst-stage embryo transfer as compared to cleavage-stage embryo transfer (risk ratios
135 [RRs]).

136 The HFEA dataset is anonymised and cycle-based, hence linkage of cycles within each woman
137 undergoing IVF/ICSI treatment was not possible. Inability to adjust for clustering of cycles
138 within women is likely to lead to spurious associations which are statistically significant. We
139 therefore opted for 99.5% confidence intervals (CIs) and a level of significance at < 0.005

140 (Sunkara *et al.*, 2014; Maheshwari *et al.*, 2016). Clinically relevant confounders that were
141 statistically different between the groups at $p < 0.20$ were included in the adjustment models
142 for each outcome (adjusted risk ratio [aRR], 99.5% CI). Potential confounders were maternal
143 age at treatment, year of treatment, duration of infertility, previous pregnancy, causes of
144 infertility, type of fertilisation (IVF/ICSI), number of fresh oocytes collected, number of
145 embryos transferred and gender of the baby. The assumption of linearity between continuous
146 covariates and outcomes was evaluated using Box-Tidwell procedure (Box and Tidwell, 1962)
147 and where assumption was violated, it was decided to include a square or polynomial
148 component as an adjustment variable into the model.

149 A sub-group analysis of women undergoing their first IVF/ICSI treatment was performed, with
150 a p value of less than 0.05 deemed statistically significant. RRs, aRRs and their 95% CIs were
151 calculated using standard methods.

152 Sensitivity analyses were performed using a multiple imputation (MI) technique for missing
153 data with the aim to test the robustness of the results obtained with the complete case method
154 in both the main and the sub-group analysis (Supplementary Table SI). Statistical analyses
155 were carried out using IBM SPSS Statistics 24.0 (Armonk, NY: IBM Corp.).

156 **Results**

157 The total number of assisted reproductive technology (ART) cycles recorded in the HFEA
158 dataset from 1991 to 2012 was 1,071,040 (Figure 1). 67,147 IVF/ICSI cycles resulting in a
159 singleton live birth were included in the main analysis (Figure 1). Of these blastocyst transfers
160 accounted for 11,152 cycles while cleavage stage transfers occurred in 55,995 cycles (Figure
161 1). The proportion of blastocyst-stage transfer cycles increased from 1999 to 2011 ($p < 0.001$)
162 (Figure 2).

163 Table I compares the baseline characteristics in the blastocyst-stage and cleavage-stage embryo
164 transfer groups. The two differed in terms of cause of infertility ($p < 0.001$) (with the exception
165 of endometriosis, $p = 0.103$), previous pregnancy ($p < 0.001$), type of fertilisation ($p < 0.001$),
166 number of fresh oocytes collected ($p < 0.001$), number of embryos transferred ($p < 0.001$),
167 elective single embryo transfer ($p < 0.001$) and number of gestational sacs ($p < 0.001$) (Table
168 I). The groups did not differ in maternal age at treatment ($p = 0.025$) and in duration of
169 infertility ($p = 0.864$), which was the only covariate with missing data (Table I).

170 Table II shows comparison of perinatal outcomes between the blastocyst-stage and cleavage-
171 stage groups. The risk of PTB (aRR 1.00, 99.5% CI 0.79-1.25) and VPTB (aRR 1.00, 99.5%
172 CI 0.63-1.54) was similar in the two groups after adjusting for confounders (Table II). The
173 risks of VLBW (aRR 0.84, 99.5% CI 0.53-1.34), LBW (aRR 0.92, 99.5% CI 0.73-1.16), HBW
174 (aRR 0.94, 99.5% CI 0.75-1.18), VHBW (aRR 1.05, 99.5% CI 0.66-1.65), TLBW (aRR 0.90,
175 99.5% CI 0.73-1.12) and THBW (aRR 0.96, 99.5% CI 0.78-1.18) were no higher following
176 blastocyst-stage embryo transfer (Table II).

177 A higher proportion of male babies, with a very low statistical and clinical significance, was
178 noted following blastocyst-stage embryo transfer (aRR 1.04, 99.5% CI 1.01-1.09) (Table II).
179 The risk of congenital anomalies was similar in the two groups (aRR 1.16, 99.5% CI 0.90-1.49)
180 (Table II).

181 There was no difference in the proportion of healthy babies between blastocyst-stage and
182 cleavage-stage embryo transfer cycles (aRR 1.00, 99.5% CI 0.93-1.07) (Table II).

183 **Sub-group analysis of women undergoing their first IVF/ICSI cycle**

184 The baseline characteristics of women undergoing their first IVF/ICSI cycle are shown in Table
185 I. Women who had blastocyst transfer differed from those who had cleavage-stage embryos
186 replaced in terms of age ($p = 0.002$), cause of infertility (with the exception of endometriosis,

187 $p = 0.175$), use of IVF versus ICSI ($p < 0.001$), oocytes collected ($p < 0.001$), number of
188 embryos transferred ($p < 0.001$) and elective single embryo transfer ($p < 0.001$) (Table I).
189 Duration of infertility was the only covariate with missing data and the proportion of cycles in
190 which the couple was trying for > 4 years was significantly higher in the cleavage-stage group
191 than in the blastocyst-stage group ($p < 0.001$).

192 Table III shows comparison of perinatal outcomes between the blastocyst-stage and cleavage-
193 stage groups. There was no significant difference in the risk of PTB (aRR 0.93, 95% CI 0.72-
194 1.21) and VPTB (aRR 1.01, 95% CI 0.61-1.64), VLBW (aRR 1.02, 95% CI 0.64-1.63), LBW
195 (aRR 0.82, 95% CI 0.63-1.07), HBW (aRR 1.03, 95% CI 0.79-1.34), VHBW (aRR 1.21, 95%
196 CI 0.69-2.11), TLBW (aRR 0.86, 95% CI 0.68-1.09) and THBW (aRR 1.06, 95% CI 0.83-
197 1.34) after blastocyst-stage embryo-transfer (Table III). The chance of delivering a male baby
198 was not increased by blastocyst-stage embryo transfer (aRR 1.04, 95% CI 1.00-1.08) (Table
199 III) but the risk of congenital anomaly was significantly higher (aRR 1.42, 95% CI 1.12-1.81)
200 (Table III). The chance of the baby being healthy was also similar in the two groups (aRR 0.97,
201 99.5% CI 0.90-1.05) (Table III).

202 **Results of sensitivity analyses**

203 Results of the sensitivity analysis using MI for missing data were comparable with those from
204 the CC method for both the main and the sub-group analyses (Table II and Table III) except
205 for a few outcomes. In the main analysis, the chance of delivering a male baby (aRR 1.04,
206 99.5% CI 1.00-1.09) was not increased by blastocyst-stage embryo transfer in the MI analysis,
207 whereas it was slightly increased in the CC analysis. In the sub-group analysis, the risk of LBW
208 (aRR 0.86, 99.5% CI 0.76-0.98) was significantly lower in blastocyst-stage embryo transfer
209 cycles in the MI analysis, whereas the difference was not statistically relevant with the CC
210 method. In women undergoing their first cycle, the risk of congenital anomaly following

211 blastocyst transfer (aRR 1.00, 95% CI 0.78-1.26) was no higher in the MI analysis but increased
212 in analysis using the CC method.

213 **Discussion**

214 **Principal findings**

215 In singleton live births conceived through fresh IVF/ICSI in the UK between 1999 and 2011,
216 the risks of PTB, VPTB, LBW and HBW were not increased following blastocyst-stage embryo
217 transfer. The chance of delivering a healthy baby was not affected by embryo transfer at
218 blastocyst-stage. The results were similar when only first cycles were included.

219 **Strengths**

220 Data were extracted from a nationwide dataset, which collates information on all IVF and ICSI
221 treatment cycles undertaken in the UK and is subject to thorough and regular checks. Our
222 analysis adjusted for important covariates recorded in the dataset such as maternal age, duration
223 of infertility, causes of infertility and year of treatment and included deliveries of singleton
224 healthy babies as an outcome.

225 **Limitations**

226 An important limitation of our study was the use of cycle-based anonymised data. Cycles
227 performed in the same women could not be linked to each other. As clustering of cycles within
228 women can lead to spuriously narrow standard errors (SEs) and CIs, statistical significance was
229 set at < 0.005 and 99.5% CIs were computed (Sunkara *et al.*, 2014; Maheshwari *et al.*, 2016).
230 In addition, we have reported outcomes in women undergoing their first IVF/ICSI treatment as
231 a sub-group analysis that addressed the issue of cycle clustering more appropriately.
232 Only cycles performed until 2011 were included in this analysis as only data up to 2012 were
233 available from the HFEA website in September 2017, when the study commenced. Data from

234 the period 2012-2019, which report a larger proportion of blastocyst transfers and reflect other
235 changes in clinical and laboratory practice (<https://www.hfea.gov.uk/about-us/publications/>),
236 have only recently become available and could not be included in our study.

237 This study was limited by the inability to adjust the results for important covariates such as
238 smoking status, body mass index (BMI), previous medical history and nature of the embryo
239 culture medium used as this information was not reported in the dataset. Information regarding
240 complications of pregnancy (gestational diabetes, hypertensive complications etc.) was also
241 not recorded. Congenital anomalies diagnosed at delivery were reported in the dataset but the
242 data did not discriminate between different kinds of anomalies. Information about perinatal
243 mortality was not available. Maternal age, gestational age at delivery and birth weight were
244 recorded in bands and parameters such as Z-scores for those outcomes could not be computed.
245 Therefore, our findings could be affected by residual confounding.

246 In order to deal with the issue of missing data among covariates (duration of infertility), the
247 CC method was initially used in both the main and sub-group analyses. One requirement in
248 order to obtain unbiased estimates with the CC method is that data must be missing completely
249 at random (MCAR) (i.e. missingness is unrelated to observed and unobserved data yielding a
250 sub-group of cases with complete data that is representative of the total cohort) (Desai *et al.*,
251 2011). It was not possible to assess the MCAR assumption in the HFEA dataset and, therefore,
252 it is likely that cases with complete data were not representative of the larger cohort and might
253 have produced biased results (Bennett, 2001; Desai *et al.*, 2011; Pedersen *et al.*, 2017).
254 Therefore, sensitivity analyses for the main dataset as well as the sub-group of women in their
255 first cycles were performed to test the robustness of their findings which showed similar results
256 Another limitation was that the analysis of a large number of cycles might have produced
257 spurious and not clinically relevant associations between outcomes and exposure groups

258 (Grimes and Schulz, 2012). This can be seen, for example, in the higher chance of delivering
259 a male baby after blastocyst-stage embryo transfer (aRR 1.04, 99.5% CI 1.01-1.09) shown in
260 the main analysis using the CC method. This association was weak and likely produced by the
261 large number of cycles included in the analysis and by the lack of adjustment for confounders
262 not recorded in the HFEA dataset such as smoking status and BMI (Grimes and Schulz, 2012).
263 As a matter of fact, although adjustment for unavailable confounders was still not possible, the
264 association was not maintained using the MI method in the main analysis and in the sub-group
265 analysis where the number of cycles was almost halved in comparison to the main analysis.

266 **Comparison with other studies**

267 Three recent register-based studies concurred with our results in reporting no increased risk of
268 PTB and VPTB in singleton pregnancies following blastocyst-stage embryo transfer as
269 compared to cleavage-stage embryo transfer (Ishihara *et al.*, 2014; Chambers *et al.*, 2015;
270 Ginström Ernstad *et al.*, 2016). Another study published in 2019 (Shi *et al.*, 2019), analysing
271 data of IVF/ICSI cycles performed in a single Chinese centre between January 2006 and
272 December 2015, did not find any significant differences in the proportions of PTB (aOR 0.99,
273 95% CI 0.71-1.37) and VPTB (aOR 2.56, 95% CI 0.97-6.78) between singleton pregnancies
274 after fresh blastocyst-stage and those after fresh cleavage-stage embryo transfer. On the other
275 hand, three older register-based studies reported a higher risk of PTB and VPTB in singleton
276 pregnancies following blastocyst-stage embryo transfer as compared to cleavage-stage embryo
277 transfer (Källén *et al.*, 2010a; Kalra *et al.*, 2012; Dar *et al.*, 2013). However, Kallen et al.
278 included fresh and frozen-thawed cycles in the analysis without adjusting results for the
279 proportions of fresh and frozen-thawed embryo transfers (Källén *et al.*, 2010a). Furthermore,
280 the number of babies born following blastocyst-stage embryo transfer (1,311) was reported to
281 be too small for the assessment of rare outcomes. The study by Kalra et al. included a larger
282 number of cases than our study but it was limited to the period 2004-2006, whereas we could

283 include cycles performed until 2011 (Kalra *et al.*, 2012). The study by Dar *et al.* included a
284 lower number of singleton pregnancies resulting from blastocyst-stage and cleavage-stage
285 embryo transfer than in our analysis. The same study could not provide a full coverage of
286 information as only 86% and 95% of Canadian ART clinics reported information in 2001 and
287 2002 respectively. In addition, the study might be at risk of recall bias as information about
288 perinatal outcomes was collected by each clinic via telephone or e-mail a posteriori (Dar *et al.*,
289 2013). Although previous studies have adjusted for several confounders, as in our study, they
290 were unable to adjust for BMI and smoking status as they were not recorded in the relevant
291 datasets (Källén *et al.*, 2010a; Kalra *et al.*, 2012; Dar *et al.*, 2013).

292 A recent Swedish register-based study by Giström Ernstad and colleagues (Ginström Ernstad
293 *et al.*, 2016) did not show an increased risk of babies weighing > 4,500 g in singleton
294 pregnancies after blastocyst-stage embryo-transfer as in our study. The same study reported a
295 lower risk of LBW with extended culture but the association was weak (aOR 0.83, 95% CI
296 0.71-0.97). This finding is similar to that of our sensitivity sub-group analysis that showed a
297 lower risk of LBW in singleton live births after extended culture. Furthermore, other studies
298 showed lower proportions of SGA babies and higher proportions of large for gestational age
299 (LGA) babies with extended culture as compared to cleavage-stage embryo transfer (Ishihara
300 *et al.*, 2014; Martins *et al.*, 2016; Wang *et al.*, 2017; Alviggi *et al.*, 2018). These studies
301 interpreted the increased proportions of LGA babies as a possible explanation for the lower
302 risks of SGA babies. We could not compare proportions of SGA and LGA babies between the
303 blastocyst-stage and the cleavage-stage groups as birth weight was recorded in bands in the
304 anonymised HFEA dataset. A recent American register-based study (Litzky *et al.*, 2018),
305 including data of fresh IVF/ICSI cycles performed between 2007 and 2014 that resulted in a
306 singleton live birth, did not show any difference in the rates of macrosomia (RR 1.00, 95% CI
307 0.96-1.04) and LBW (RR 1.00, 95% CI 0.93-1.06) between the blastocyst-stage and the

308 cleavage-stage transfer groups. However, as in our study, they used unlinked data and could
309 examine repeated cycles in the same women. Only good prognosis cycles resulting in a
310 pregnancy delivered at term were included. Important covariates such as types of culture media
311 used and obstetric complications during pregnancy could not be included in adjustment models.

312 In our main analysis, we found an increase in the proportion of male babies after blastocyst-
313 stage embryo transfer (aRR 1.04, 99.5% CI 1.01-1.09) which was statistically significant but
314 of minimal clinical significance. This result was not confirmed in the sub-group analysis of
315 women undergoing an initial IVF/ICSI cycle. The vast majority of previous studies did not
316 show differences in the proportion of male babies among singletons born as a result of embryo-
317 transfer at blastocyst-stage when compared to cleavage-stage embryo transfer (Wikland *et al.*,
318 2010; Martin *et al.*, 2012; Oron *et al.*, 2014; De Vos *et al.*, 2015; Maxwell *et al.*, 2015; Li *et*
319 *al.*, 2017). A register-based study exploring this outcome (Ginström Ernstad *et al.*, 2016) found
320 a higher proportion of male babies in singleton pregnancies with extended culture as compared
321 to cleavage-stage embryo transfer (aOR 1.10, 95% CI 1.03-1.17). A similar result has been
322 found in the recent single centre study by Shi and colleagues (aOR 1.17, 95% CI 1.07-1.30).
323 (Shi *et al.*, 2019). However, in both cases, the association was weak as that reported in our
324 main analysis and likely referable to residual confounding (Ginström Ernstad *et al.*, 2016).

325 Almost all the previous studies found a similar risk of congenital anomaly between blastocyst-
326 stage and cleavage-stage singletons (Wikland *et al.*, 2010; Martin *et al.*, 2012; Dar *et al.*, 2013;
327 Oron *et al.*, 2014, 2015; Ginström Ernstad *et al.*, 2016). In our study, the risk of congenital
328 anomaly was similar between the groups with the exception of the sub-group CC analysis
329 where the risk was increased in the blastocyst-stage group. However, the number of cycles
330 included in the sub-group analysis was almost halved in comparison to the main analysis and
331 cycles with missing data were excluded in the computation of aRRs using the CC method. An
332 increased risk was no longer observed after imputation of missing data in the sensitivity

333 analysis. By contrast, a Swedish register-based study published in 2010 reported a higher risk
334 of congenital anomaly in singletons following extended culture when compared to singletons
335 following cleavage-stage embryo transfer (aOR 1.43, 95% CI 1.14-1.81) (Källén *et al.*, 2010b).
336 However, this study used data from 2002 to 2006, analysed fresh and frozen cycles as a single
337 group and did not adjust for a number of relevant confounders.

338 **Implications for clinical practice**

339 Our findings provide some reassurance for women undergoing blastocyst transfers at a time
340 when this strategy is gaining popularity across the world. Extended culture represents an
341 effective way of maintaining high pregnancy rates with eSET whilst reducing the risk of
342 multiple pregnancy (Glujovsky *et al.*, 2016).

343 **Implications for research**

344 As with all observational research, we were unable to adjust for unrecorded confounders. An
345 option to overcome this limitation might be to analyse data on perinatal outcomes in children
346 conceived through either blastocyst-stage or cleavage-stage embryos from the relevant RCTs
347 comparing the two strategies of embryo transfer. However, the available RCTs span nearly two
348 decades and, unless specific consent was obtained at the time of the initial trial, obtaining
349 follow up data might be impossible.

350 Another option might be to use data from national registries and other published studies,
351 including RCTs, across the world to conduct an individual patient data meta-analysis (IPD-
352 MA) (Riley *et al.*, 2010). This method would increase power for the assessment of rare
353 outcomes and, unlike meta-analyses of aggregated data, allow researchers to adjust for
354 confounders, if available

355 **Conclusion**

356 Perinatal outcomes in singleton live births associated with the transfer of fresh blastocysts are
357 not different from those of singleton live births after cleavage-stage embryo transfer. However,
358 although our findings are reassuring for women having the transfer of fresh blastocyst-stage
359 embryos, our study is based on observational data with several limitations. Further robust
360 evidence is needed before drawing a definitive conclusion about perinatal safety of extended
361 embryo culture.

362 **Author's roles**

363 N.M., A.M. and S.B conception and design. N.M. and E.A.R. acquisition of the data and
364 statistical analysis. N.M. wrote the article. A.M., S.B. and E.A.R provided intellectual input
365 from the protocol stage right through all versions of the manuscript. All authors contributed to
366 the final version of the manuscript.

367 **Acknowledgements**

368 The study presented in this article is the result of the research activity for a Thesis presented
369 for the Degree of Master of Science in Obstetrics and Gynaecology at the University of
370 Aberdeen by Dr. Nicola Marconi.

371 **Funding**

372 The research activity of Dr. Nicola Marconi was funded by the Italian Scholarship “A. Griffini
373 – J. Miglierina”, Provincia di Varese, Italy.

374 **Conflict of interest**

375 The authors have no conflict of interest.

376 **Reference list**

377 Alviggi C, Conforti A, Carbone IF, Borrelli R, Placido G De, Guerriero S. Influence of

- 378 cryopreservation on perinatal outcome after blastocyst- vs cleavage-stage embryo
379 transfer: systematic review and meta-analysis. *Ultrasound Obstet Gynecol* 2018;**51**:54–
380 63.
- 381 Bennett DA. How can I deal with missing data in my study? *Aust N Z J Public Health*
382 2001;**25**:464–469.
- 383 Box GEP, Tidwell PW. Transformation of the independent variables. *Technometrics*
384 1962;**4**:531–550.
- 385 Chambers GM, Chughtai AA, Farquhar CM, Wang YA. Risk of preterm birth after blastocyst
386 embryo transfer: a large population study using contemporary registry data from
387 Australia and New Zealand. *Fertil Steril* 2015;**104**:997–1003.
- 388 Dar S, Librach CL, Gunby J, Bissonnette F, Cowan L, IVF Directors Group of Canadian
389 Fertility and Andrology Society. Increased risk of preterm birth in singleton pregnancies
390 after blastocyst versus Day 3 embryo transfer: Canadian ART Register (CARTR)
391 analysis. *Hum Reprod* 2013;**28**:924–928.
- 392 Desai M, Esserman DA, Gammon MD, Terry MB. The use of complete-case and multiple
393 imputation-based analyses in molecular epidemiology studies that assess interaction
394 effects. *Epidemiol Perspect Innov* 2011;**8**:5.
- 395 DeVos A, Janssens R, VandeVelde H, Haentjens P, Bonduelle M, Tournaye H, Verheyen G.
396 The type of culture medium and the duration of in vitro culture do not influence
397 birthweight of ART singletons. *Hum Reprod* 2015;**30**:20–27.
- 398 Ginström Ernstad E, Bergh C, Khatibi A, Källén KB, Westlander G, Nilsson S, Wennerholm
399 UB. Neonatal and maternal outcome after blastocyst transfer: a population-based
400 registry study. *Am J Obstet Gynecol* 2016;**214**:378.e1-378.e10.

- 401 Glujovsky D, Farquhar C, Quinteiro Retamar AM, Alvarez Sedo CR, Blake D. Cleavage
402 stage versus blastocyst stage embryo transfer in assisted reproductive technology.
403 *Cochrane database Syst Rev* 2016;CD002118.
- 404 Grimes DA, Schulz KF. False alarms and pseudo-epidemics: the limitations of observational
405 epidemiology. *Obstet Gynecol* 2012;**120**:920–927.
- 406 Hibbs AM, Black D, Palermo L, Cnaan A, Luan X, Truog WE, Walsh MC, Ballard RA.
407 Accounting for Multiple Births in Neonatal and Perinatal Trials: Systematic Review and
408 Case Study. *J Pediatr* 2010;**156**:202–208.
- 409 Ishihara O, Araki R, Kuwahara A, Itakura A, Saito H, Adamson GD. Impact of frozen-
410 thawed single-blastocyst transfer on maternal and neonatal outcome: an analysis of
411 277,042 single-embryo transfer cycles from 2008 to 2010 in Japan. *Fertil Steril*
412 2014;**101**:128–133.
- 413 Källén B, Finnström O, Lindam A, Nilsson E, Nygren KG, Olausson PO. Blastocyst versus
414 cleavage stage transfer in in vitro fertilization: Differences in neonatal outcome? *Fertil*
415 *Steril* 2010a;**94**:1680–1683.
- 416 Källén B, Finnström O, Lindam A, Nilsson E, Nygren KG, Olausson PO. Blastocyst versus
417 cleavage stage transfer in in vitro fertilization: differences in neonatal outcome? *Fertil*
418 *Steril* 2010b;**94**:1680–1683.
- 419 Kalra SK, Ratcliffe SJ, Barnhart KT, Coutifaris C. Extended embryo culture and an increased
420 risk of preterm delivery. *Obstet Gynecol* 2012;**120**:69–75.
- 421 Li W, Xue X, Zhao W, Ren A, Zhuo W, Shi J. Blastocyst transfer is not associated with
422 increased unfavorable obstetric and perinatal outcomes compared with cleavage-stage
423 embryo transfer. *Gynecol Endocrinol* 2017;**33**:857–860.

- 424 Litzky JF, Boulet SL, Esfandiari N, Zhang Y, Kissin DM, Theiler RN, Marsit CJ.
425 Birthweight in infants conceived through in vitro fertilization following blastocyst or
426 cleavage-stage embryo transfer : a national registry study. *J Assist Reprod Genet*
427 2018;**35**:1027–1037.
- 428 Maheshwari A, Kalampokas T, Davidson J, Bhattacharya S. Obstetric and perinatal outcomes
429 in singleton pregnancies resulting from the transfer of blastocyst-stage versus cleavage-
430 stage embryos generated through in vitro fertilization treatment: a systematic review and
431 meta-analysis. *Fertil Steril* 2013;**100**:1615-1621.e1-10.
- 432 Maheshwari A, Pandey S, Amalraj Raja E, Shetty A, Hamilton M, Bhattacharya S. Is frozen
433 embryo transfer better for mothers and babies? Can cumulative meta-analysis provide a
434 definitive answer? *Hum Reprod Update* 2018;**24**:35–58.
- 435 Maheshwari A, Raja EA, Bhattacharya S. Obstetric and perinatal outcomes after either fresh
436 or thawed frozen embryo transfer: an analysis of 112,432 singleton pregnancies recorded
437 in the Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority anonymized dataset. *Fertil Steril*
438 2016;**106**:1703–1708.
- 439 Martin L, Frapsauce C, Royere D, Guerif F. Single pregnancy outcome after blastocyst
440 transfer: comparison with cleavage stage embryo transfers. *Gynecol Obstet {&} Fertil*
441 2012;**40**:291–295.
- 442 Martins WP, Nastri CO, Rienzi L, Poel SZ van Der, Gracia CR, Racowsky C. Obstetrical and
443 perinatal outcomes following blastocyst transfer compared to cleavage transfer: a
444 systematic review and meta-analysis. *Hum Reprod* 2016;**31**:2561–2569.
- 445 Maxwell SM, Melzer-Ross K, McCulloh DH, Grifo JA. A comparison of pregnancy
446 outcomes between day 3 and day 5/6 embryo transfers: does day of embryo transfer
447 really make a difference? *J Assist Reprod Genet* 2015;**32**:249–254.

- 448 Oron G, Nayot D, Son WY, Holzer H, Buckett W, Tulandi T. Obstetric and perinatal
449 outcome from single cleavage transfer and single blastocyst transfer: a matched case-
450 control study. *Gynecol Endocrinol* 2015;**31**:469–472.
- 451 Oron G, Sokal-Arnon T, Son WY, Demirtas E, Buckett W, Zeadna A, Holzer H, Tulandi T.
452 Extended embryo culture is not associated with increased adverse obstetric or perinatal
453 outcome. *Am J Obstet Gynecol* 2014;**211**:165.e1-7.
- 454 Pedersen AB, Mikkelsen EM, Cronin-Fenton D, Kristensen NR, Pham TM, Pedersen L,
455 Petersen I. Missing data and multiple imputation in clinical epidemiological research.
456 *Clin Epidemiol* 2017;**9**:157–166.
- 457 Riley RD, Lambert PC, Abo-zaid G. Meta-analysis of individual participant data: rationale,
458 conduct, and reporting. *BMJ* 2010;**340**:c221.
- 459 Shi W, Zhang W, Li N, Xue X, Liu C, Qu P, Shi J, Huang C. Comparison of perinatal
460 outcomes following blastocyst and cleavage-stage embryo transfer: analysis of 10 years'
461 data from a single centre. *Reprod Biomed Online* 2019;**38**:967–978.
- 462 Sunkara SK, Khalaf Y, Maheshwari A, Seed P, Coomarasamy A. Association between
463 response to ovarian stimulation and miscarriage following IVF: an analysis of 124 351
464 IVF pregnancies. *Hum Reprod* 2014;**29**:1218–1224.
- 465 Vega M, Zaghi S, Buyuk E, Jindal S. Not all twins are monozygotic after elective single
466 embryo transfer: analysis of 32,600 elective single embryo transfer cycles as reported to
467 the Society for Assisted Reproductive Technology. *Fertil Steril* 2018;**109**:118–122.
- 468 Wang X, Du M, Guan Y, Wang B, Zhang J, Liu Z. Comparative neonatal outcomes in
469 singleton births from blastocyst transfers or cleavage-stage embryo transfers: a
470 systematic review and meta-analysis. *Reprod Biol Endocrinol* 2017;**15**:36.

- 471 Wikland M, Hardarson T, Hillensjö T, Westin C, Westlander G, Wood M, Wennerholm UB.
472 Obstetric outcomes after transfer of vitrified blastocysts. *Hum Reprod* 2010;**25**:1699–
473 1707.